

1 ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION  
 2 CINDY COHN (145997)  
 3 cindy@eff.org  
 4 LEE TIEN (148216)  
 5 tien@eff.org  
 6 KURT OPSAHL (191303)  
 7 kurt@eff.org  
 8 KEVIN S. BANKSTON (217026)  
 9 bankston@eff.org  
 10 CORYNNE MCSHERRY (221504)  
 11 corynne@eff.org  
 12 JAMES S. TYRE (083117)  
 13 jstyre@eff.org  
 14 454 Shotwell Street  
 15 San Francisco, CA 94110  
 16 Telephone: 415/436-9333  
 17 415/436-9993 (fax)

18 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

19 [Additional counsel appear on signature page.]

20

21

22

23

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

24

IN RE NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY )  
 TELECOMMUNICATIONS RECORDS )  
 LITIGATION, MDL No. 1791 )

MDL Docket No 06-1791 VRW  
 Relates to Case No. C-06-0672-VRW

25

This Document Relates To: )

**CLASS ACTION**

26

Hepting, et. al v. AT&T Corporation, et. al )

**PLAINTIFFS' STATUS REPORT  
 PURSUANT TO AUGUST 14, 2006  
 ORDER**

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

1 Pursuant to the Court's Order of August 14, 2006 (C-06-0672-VRW Dkt. 336), plaintiffs  
2 provide the following:

3 **A. Status of 28 USC § 1407 transfers pursuant to MDL 1791.**

4 As this Court is aware, on August 10, 2006, the Judicial Panel on Multi-District Litigation  
5 transferred 17 cases docketed with the panel under MDL 1791 to this Court. According to the  
6 docket in MDL 06-1791-VRW, the Northern District Clerk's Office has received the case files in  
7 14 of these actions, including *Hepting*, as of September 15, 2006. On August 31, 2006, the MDL  
8 panel conditionally transferred an additional 21 "tag-along" cases to this Court, subject to  
9 oppositions to transfer being filed with the panel by parties to those cases. Two of the transferred  
10 cases have since been dismissed (*Potter v. Bellsouth* (M.D. Tenn.) and *Tyler v. AT&T et. al* (D.  
11 Neb.)). Any notice of opposition to the transfer of a tag-along case must be filed with the MDL  
12 panel by September 15, 2006.

13 Two of the conditionally transferred tag-along cases are solely against the government and  
14 are not also brought against telecommunications companies. Those are *Al-Haramain Islamic*  
15 *Foundation v. Bush* (D. Ore.) and *CCR v. Bush* (S.D. N.Y.). *Al-Haramain* has been the subject of  
16 an Order by the District Court denying the government's motion on state secrets grounds to dismiss  
17 or, in the alternative, for summary judgment; the Court certified its order for interlocutory appeal  
18 pursuant to §1292(b). *Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush*, 2006 WL 2583425 (D. Ore.  
19 Sept. 7, 2006). The deadline for the government to petition for review by the 9<sup>th</sup> Circuit has not yet  
20 passed. The *CCR* case has been fully briefed and oral argument held on the government's motion  
21 to dismiss or in the alternative for summary judgment based upon the states secrets privilege and  
22 on a cross motion for summary judgment brought by the plaintiffs.

23 On September 12, 2006, Defendant AT&T notified the MDL panel that it considered five  
24 additional cases arising out of administrative subpoenas issued by Attorneys General and Public  
25 Utilities Commissioners in several states (New Jersey, Missouri (2 cases), Maine, Connecticut) to  
26 be potential tag-alongs in this litigation.

27 Plaintiffs' counsel for the transferred cases have been conferring and believe that they can  
28 present a Joint and Agreed Organization and Case Management Plan in advance of a case

1 management conference set for a time at the court's earliest convenience. Unlike some multi-  
2 defendant MDL proceedings in which all defendants are alleged to have acted in concert, these  
3 cases involve numerous separate defendants who have each acted independently. The factual  
4 allegations of each case, and the legal consequences of those facts in light of the Court's July 20,  
5 2006 Order (C-06-0672-VRW Dkt. #308), vary tremendously. Accordingly, plaintiffs anticipate  
6 that the MDL proceedings will best be managed by coordinating rather than consolidating all of the  
7 cases.

8 **B. Interlocutory Appeal Petitions of the Government and AT&T**

9 The 28 U.S.C. § 1292(b) interlocutory appeal petitions of the Government and AT&T, and  
10 the cross-petition of plaintiffs, are still pending before the 9<sup>th</sup> Circuit. As of the date of this filing,  
11 no action has yet been taken on them.

12 **C. Plaintiffs' Pending Motion For Preliminary Injunction**

13 Plaintiffs filed their pending motion for a preliminary injunction on March 31, 2006, nearly  
14 six months ago (C-06-0672-VRW Dkt # 16). As the parties and the Court discussed at length  
15 during the hearing on August 8, 2006, plaintiffs seek to move forward with their pending  
16 preliminary injunction motion as quickly as possible. To that end, plaintiffs propose the following  
17 occur once the current stay expires on September 29, 2006:

18 First, the discovery previously noticed by plaintiffs in support of their preliminary  
19 injunction motion should go forward. To the extent that this discovery implicates the government's  
20 state secrets concerns, it should proceed under the procedures outlined by the Court in its July 20,  
21 2006 Order, including appointment of a Court expert or consultant pursuant to F.R.E. 706 as  
22 discussed during the August 8, 2006 hearing, as well as under the processes outlined in 50 U.S.C.  
23 § 1806(f). To the extent that plaintiffs seek information that does not implicate state secret  
24 concerns (e.g., public statements by AT&T), discovery related to the injunction should go forward  
25 as it would in any other case.

26 Second, the Court should set a briefing schedule and early hearing date for plaintiffs'  
27 preliminary injunction motion. This briefing schedule should accommodate the discovery that  
28 plaintiffs seek in support of their motion and the filing of an answer by the AT&T defendants, with

1 the answer also filed under the procedures discussed in the Court's July 20, 2006, Order and 50  
2 U.S.C. § 1806(f).

3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

DATED: September 15, 2006

ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION

By \_\_\_\_\_ /s/  
Cindy A. Cohn, Esq. (SBN 145997)  
Lee Tien, Esq. (SBN 148216)  
Kurt Opsahl, Esq. (SBN 191303)  
Kevin S. Bankston, Esq. (SBN 217026)  
Corynne McSherry, Esq. (SBN 221504)  
James S. Tyre, Esq. (SBN 083117)  
454 Shotwell Street  
San Francisco, CA 94110  
Telephone: (415) 436-9333 x108  
Facsimile: (415) 436-9993

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

Additional Plaintiffs' Counsel:

LERACH COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER  
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP  
ERIC ALAN ISAACSON  
655 West Broadway, Suite 1900  
San Diego, CA 92101-3301  
Telephone: (619) 231-1058  
Facsimile: (619) 231-7423

LERACH COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER  
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP  
REED R. KATHREIN  
JEFF D. FRIEDMAN  
MARIA V. MORRIS  
SHANA E. SCARLETT  
100 Pine Street, Suite 2600  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 288-4545  
Facsimile: (415) 288-4534

TRABER & VOORHEES  
BERT VOORHEES  
THERESA M. TRABER  
128 North Fair Oaks Avenue, Suite 204  
Pasadena, CA 91103  
Telephone: (626) 585-9611  
Facsimile: (626) 577-7079

LAW OFFICE OF RICHARD R. WIEBE  
RICHARD R. WIEBE  
425 California Street, Suite 2025  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 433-3200  
Facsimile: (415) 433-6382

LAW OFFICE OF ARAM ANTARAMIAN  
ARAM ANTARAMIAN  
1714 Blake Street  
Berkeley, CA 94703  
Telephone: (510) 841-2369

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on September 15, 2006, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the e-mail addresses denoted on the attached Electronic Mail Notice List, and I hereby certify that I have mailed the foregoing document or paper via the United States Postal Service to the non-CM/ECF participants listed on the following pages.

By \_\_\_\_\_ /s/  
Cindy A. Cohn, Esq. (SBN.145997)  
ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION  
454 Shotwell Street  
San Francisco, CA 94110  
Telephone: (415) 436-9333 x108  
Facsimile: (415) 436-9993  
cindy@eff.org

1 David L. Anderson  
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP  
2 50 Fremont Street  
Post Office Box 7880  
3 San Francisco, CA 94120-7880

David W. Carpenter  
Sidley Austin Brown & Wood LLP  
Bank One Plaza  
10 South Dearborn Street  
Chicago, IL 60600

4 Darrell Lee Barger  
Hartline acus et all  
5 800 N. Shoreline Blvd.  
Suite 2000N  
6 Corpus Christi, TX 78401

Edward Morgan Carstarphen, III  
Ellis Carstearphen et all  
5847 San Felipe  
Suite 1900  
Houston, TX 77057

7 Marc Oliver Beem  
Miller Shakman & Hamilton, LLP  
8 180 North LaSalle Street  
Suite 3600  
9 Chicago, IL 60601

Catherine J. Casey  
DLA Piper rudnick Gray Cary US LLP  
203 North LaSalle Street  
#1900  
Chicago, IL 60601

10 John Beisner  
O'Melveny & Myers LLP  
11 555 13th Street, N.W.  
Suite 500 West  
12 Washington, DC 20004-1109

Amato A. DeLuca  
DeLuca & Weizenbaum, Ltd.  
199 North Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903

13 Steven K. Blackhurst  
Ater Wynne Hewitt Dodson & Skerritt  
14 222 S.W. Columbia Ste 1800  
Portland, OR 97201-6618

Nancy Scott Degan  
Baker Donelson Bearman Caldwell &  
Berkowitz, PC  
201 St. Charle Avenue  
Suite 3600  
New Orleans, LA 70170

15 David Blair-Loy  
16 ACLU Foundation of San Diego/Imperial  
Counties  
17 P.O. Box 87131  
San Diego, CA 92138

Val Patrick Exnicios  
Liska Exnicios & Nungesser  
One Canal Place  
365 Canal Street  
New Orleans, LA 70130

18 D. Douglas Brothers  
19 George & Brothers  
110 Norwood Tower  
20 115 West 7th Street  
Suite 1100  
21 Austin, TX 78701

Tyrone C. Fahner  
Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw LLP  
71 South Wacker Drive  
Chicago, IL 60606

22 James M. Carlson  
Ungaretti & Harris LLP  
23 3500 Three First National Plaza  
Chicago, IL 60602

Daniel Martin Feeney  
Miller Shakman & Beem LLP  
180 North LaSalle Street  
Suite 3600  
Chicago, IL 60601

24 David R. Carpenter  
25 Sidley Austin LLP  
One South Dearborn Street  
26 Chicago, IL 60603

Sheila Marie Finnegan  
Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw LLP  
71 South Wacker Drive  
Chicago, IL 60606

27  
28

1	Jodi W. Flowers Motley Rice, LLC 28 Bridgeside Boulevard P.O. Box 1792 Mount Pleasant, SC 29465	C. J. Johnson Kalkstein Law Firm P.O. Box 8568 Missoula, MT 59807
4	Amy Collins Fontenot Liska, Exnicios & Nungesser One Canal Place 365 Canal Street Suite 2290 New Orleans, LA 70130	Joshua Karsh Gessler Hughes Piers Resnick & Dym Ltd. Three First National Plaza 70 West Madison Street, Suite 4000 Chicago, IL 60602
8	Zachary J. Freeman Miller Shakman & Beem LLP 180 N. La Salle Street Suite 3600 Chicago, IL 60601	Peter D. Keisler United States Department of Justice Assistant Attorney General 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW Room 7312 Washington, DC 20530
11	Susan A. Freiwald USF School of LAW 2130 Fulton St San Francisco, CA 94117	Jonathan D. King DLA Piper Rudnick Gray Cary US LLP 203 North LaSalle Street #1900 Chicago, IL 60601-1293
14	Daniel N. Gall c/o Luna Innocations 2851 Commerce Street Blacksburg, VA 24060	Joseph R. Knight Baker Botts LLP 98 San Jacinto Blvd. Suite 1500 Austin, TX 78701-4039
16	F. Thomas Hecht Ungaretti & Harris LLP 3500 Three First National Plaza Chicago, IL 60602	Craig A. Knot Kirkland & Ellis 200 E Randolph Dr Ste 6100 Chicago, IL 60601
19	Anthony D. Irpino Irpino Law Firm 365 Canal Street 22nd Floor New Orleans, LA 70130	Leondra Kruger Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale & Dorr LLP 1875 Pennsylvania NW Avenue Washington, DC 20006-3642
22	Joseph G. Jevic, III St. Martin & Williams 4084 Highway 311 P.O. Box 2017 Houma, LA 70361-2017	Melanie G. Lagarde St. Martin & Williams 4084 Highway 311 Houma, LA 70360
25	Philip J. John, Jr Baker & Botts One Shell Plaza 910 Louisiana Street Houston, TX 77002	David L. Lawson Sidley Austin Brown & Wood 1501 K Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005

27  
28

1	Roger L. Mandel Stanley Mandel & Iola LLP 3100 Monticello ave Suite 750 Dallas, TX 75205	Harry Rosenberg Phelps Dunbar, LLP Canal Place 365 Canal Street Suite 2000 New Orleans, LA 70130-6534
4	Howard A. Merten Partridge, Snow & Hahn LLP 180 South Main Street Providence, RI 02903	Michael J. Ross Slater Ross 1850 Benjamin Franklin Plaza 1 S.W. Columbia Street Portland, OR 97258
7	Randolph D. Moss Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale & Dorr LLP 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20006	William A. Rossbach Rossbach & Whiston 401 North Washington Street P.O. Box 8988 Missoula, MT 59807-8988
9	Michael C. O'Malley Siben & Siben, LLP 90 East Main Street BayShore, NY 11706	Alan Norris Salpeter Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw 190 South LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60603
11	Michele L. Odorizzi Mayer Brown Rowe & Maw 190 South LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60603	Mark Schlosberg American Civil Liberties Union Fndt. 1663 Mission Street, Suite 460 San Francisco, CA 94103
14	Wendy Sangbee Park Roger Baldwin Foundation of ACLU, Inc. 180 North Michigan Avenue Suite 2300 Chicago, IL 60601	Eric Schneider 1730 South Federal Hwy. #104 Delray Beach, FL 33483
17	Robert J. Patterson Watts Law Firm LLP 555 N. Carancahua Street Twr II Bldg 14th Floor Corpus Christi, TX 78401	Adam D. Schwartz Roger Baldwin Foundation of ACLU, Inc. 180 North Michigan Avenue Suite 2300 Chicago, IL 60601-7401
20	Paul Lee Peyronnin Baker donelson Bearman Caldwell & Berkowitz, PC 201 St. Charles Ave. Suite 3600 New Orleans, LA 70170	Christopher A. Slater Slater & Ross 1 S.W. Columbia Street Suite 1850 Portland, OR 97258
24	Michael James Philippi Ungaretti & Harris LLP 3500 Three First National Plaza Chicago, IL 60602	Michael A. St. Pierre Revens Revens & St. Pierre 946 Centerville Road Warwick, RI 02886
26	Jason S. Ritchie Holland & Hart P.O. Box 639 Billings, MT 59103	

- 1 Marc Ver Der Hout  
Ver Der Hout & Brigagliano
- 2 180 Sutter Street, 5th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94123
- 3
- 4 Nicholas Wagner  
Law Offices of Wagner & Jones
- 5 1111 East Herndon, Suite 317  
Fresno, CA 93720
- 6 Thomas P. Walsh  
United States Attorney's Office NDIL
- 7 219 South Dearborn Street  
Suite 500
- 8 Chicago, IL 60604
- 9 Peter Wasylyk  
Law Offices of Peter Wasylyk
- 10 1307 Chalkstone Avenue  
Providence, RI 02908
- 11
- 12 Mikal C. Watts  
Watts Law Firm, LLP
- 13 Bank of America Plaza  
300 Convent Street
- 14 Suite 100  
San Antonio, TX 78205
- 15 Conrad S.P. Williams, III  
St. Martin, Williams & Bourque
- 16 P.O. Box 2017  
Houma, LA 70361
- 17
- 18 Martin Woodward  
Stanley, Mandel & Iola, LLP
- 19 3100 Monticello Avenue  
Suite 750
- 20 Dallas, TX 75205
- 21 Matthew A. Woolf  
Baker Donelson Bearman Caldwell &  
Berkowitz, PC
- 22 201 St. Charles Ave.  
Suite 3600
- 23 New Orleans, LA 70170
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28